Board of County Commissioners Tim Flakoll Tony Grindberg Jim Kapitan Duane Breitling Joel Vettel



PO Box 2806 211 Ninth Street South Fargo, North Dakota 58108 701-241-5609 www.casscountynd.gov

MEMO

TO: Cass County Board of Commissioners

FROM: Taylor Kaushagen, Commission Assistant

and Tax Equalization Office

DATE: December 26, 2024

SUBJECT: Abatement applications for Park Ridge Apartments, LLP

For your consideration are two applications for abatement or refund of taxes submitted by Park Ridge Apartments, LLP:

#4582— 200 8th St S – Reduce from \$4,413,000 to \$3,548,000 for 2023 #4583— 200 8th St S – Reduce from \$4,413,000 to \$3,434,000 for 2024

The City of Fargo assessing office reviewed the applications and recommends the following abatement application be approved:

#4582— 200 8th St S – Reduce from \$4,413,000 to \$3,700,000 for 2023 #4583— 200 8th St S – Reduce from \$4,413,000 to \$3,700,000 for 2024

SUGGESTED MOTION:

Move to approve abatement application #4582 for a property located at 200 8th Street South in Fargo and reduce from the value \$4,413,000 to \$3,700,000 for 2023; and approve abatement application #4583 for a property located at 200 8th Street South in Fargo and reduce the value from \$4,413,000 to \$3,700,000 for 2024.

Owner: Park Ridge Apartments LLP

Appeal of Assessment for Year: 2023 & 2024

Name of Applicant: Michael Block, Ryan Tax Firm

Assessed Value: 2023 4,413,000 2024 4,413,000 Requested Values: 2023 3,584,000 2024 3,434,000

General Property Information

 Property Type)
 Apartment

 Year Built
 1993

 Building Area (sf)
 55,276
 79.84 / sf

 Building Area (Gross sf)
 75,359
 58.56 / sf

 Apartment Units
 37
 119,270 / unit





Summary

The appellant is requesting reductions of 18.7% and 22.2% for the 2023 and 2024 tax years, respectively. The appellant provided financial statements, an income approach to valuation for both years, and a list of comparable properties to support the requested reductions.

City staff examined the value using the sales comparison approach, income approach, and cost approach. The analysis centered on a valuation of \$3,700,000 for both years. This represents a decrease of \$713,000, or 16.2%, for both 2023 and 2024.

City staff provides comparable sales and competing property assessments to support the recommended value. The subject property was built as a luxury apartment building in 1993 and has unusually large units for its age. Using price per apartment as a unit of comparison may be misleading if competing and comparable properties do not have a similar unit mix. The following three comparable sales were chosen based on their unit mix, property characteristics, and age. The competing property set was selected primarily based on proximity to the subject and property characteristics.

Comparable Sales Summary

Address	Property Type	Units	Size (SF)	Year Built	Sale Date	Sale Price (Contract)	Sale Price (Adjusted)	\$/Unit (Adj)	\$/SF (Adj)
1810 39 ST S	Apartment	48	55,332	1998	Apr-22	4,004,000	3,979,676	82,910	71.92
2651 36 AVE S	Apartment	120	124,367	1992	Jun-21	7,644,000	9,295,764	77,465	74.74
5050 40 AVE S	Apartment	117	166,453	2005	Jun-19	10,500,000	10,760,265	92,224	64.82
					True & Full Value		4,413,000	119,270	79.84
Subject	Apartment	37	55,276	1993	Applicant's Request	ed Value (2023)	3,584,000	96,864	64.84
					Applicant's Requested Value (2024)		3,434,000	92,811	62.12
		•		•	Assessor's Recomm	ended Value	3,700,000	100,000	66.94

Competing Properties (Assessed Values) Summary

	Full Value	\$/Unit	\$/SF
Maximum	5,596,000	119,270	80
75 th Percentile	3,371,100	86,148	78
Median	1,497,300	67,372	64
25 th Percentile	1,212,700	62,388	54
Minimum	720,200	52,958	39
True & Full Value	4,413,000	119,270	80
Recommended Value	3,700,000	100,000	67

Recommended Action: Reduce the 2023 & 2024 True & Full Value to \$3,700,000

RECEIVED

Application For Abatement Or Refund Of Taxes North Dakota Century Code § 57-23-04

File with the County Auditor on or before November 1 of the year following the year in which the tax becomes delinquent 155 00 AUDITOR

State of North Dakota	Assessment District City of Fargo WOV 07 2024 PHOZ:
County of Cass	Property I.D. No. 01-2240-02645-000
Name Park Ridge Apartments, LLP	Telephone No. (763) 445-4184
Address 150 South Fifth Street Minneapolis, N	IN 55402
Legal description of the property involved in this application of the property involved in this application of the property involved in this application of the property involved in this application. ORIGINAL TOWNSITE LOTS 4-6 BLK 23 VAC ALLEY ADJ TO LOTS 4-6 *01-19-93	& PT LOT 3 DESC AS: N 75' OF W 25' LOT 3 AND N 10'
Total true and full value of the property described above for the year2024is:	Total true and full value of the property described above for the year <u>2024</u> should be:
Land \$_85.000	Land S_85,000
Improvements \$ 4,328,000	Improvements \$ 3,349,000
Total \$\\\\ \\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\	Total \$ 3,434,000 (2)
The difference of \$ 1,064,000.00 true and full	value between (1) and (2) above is due to the following reason(s):
 6. Duplicate assessment 7. Property improvement was destroyed or damaged b 8. Error in noting payment of taxes, taxes erroneously 	alue exceeds the market value on, or extending the tax Attach a copy of Application for Property Tax Exemption. by fire, flood, tornado, or other natural disaster (see N.D.C.C. § 57-23-04(1)(g))
question #5.	tial or commercial property described above. For agricultural property, go directly to
	ate of purchase:Other (explain)
	ce? Estimated value: \$
Has the property been offered for sale on the open market	ot? If yes, how long?
Asking price: \$ Terms of sale:	
	Purpose of appraisal:
	Market value estimate: \$
Appraisal was made by whom?	
	involved in this application is \$
5. The estimated agricultural productive value of this proper	erty is excessive because of the following condition(s):
Applicant asks that the property	accessment be reduced.
appraisal of the property. I understand the official will give n	ove-described property by an authorized assessment official for the purpose of making an all reasonable notification of the inspection. See N.D.C.C. § 57-23-05.1. The provides for a Class A misdemeanor for making a false statement in a governmental and belief, a true and correct application.
Signature of Preparer (if other than applicant)	11/5/24 Date Signature of Applicant Date

24775 (2-2016)

Recommendation of the Governing Body of the City or Township

Recommendation of the gove	erning board of				
On	, the g	overning board of this municipali	ty, after examination of this	application and the facts, passed	
a resolution recommending to	o the Board of County Con	nmissioners that the application b	e		
Dated this	day of		ity Auditor or Township Cle	rk	
	Action	by the Board of County Con	nmissioners		
Application wasAppro	by accoved/Rejected	ion of	County Board o	of Commissioners.	
Based upon an examin	ation of the facts and the p	rovisions of North Dakota Centur	v Code 8 57-23-04, we app	rove this application. The tayable	
		to \$			
				in full settlement of taxes for the	
tax year					
	*				
County Auditor		Certification of County Aud	itor	Chairperson	
I certify that the Board	of County Commissioners	took the action stated above and t	he records of my office and	the office of the County Treasurer	
show the following facts as to	the assessment and the pa	yment of taxes on the property do		P	
Year	Taxable Value	Tax	Date Paid (if paid)	Payment Made Under Written Protest?	
				yes/no	
I further certify that the taxab	le valuation and the taxes of	ordered abated or refunded by the	Board of County Commiss	ioner are as follows:	
Year	Reduction in	n Taxable Valuation	Reduction in Taxes		
		Ω,			
	Application For Abatement Or Refund Of Taxes	urk Ridge Apartments	ounty Auditor's File No. 1003 Ate Application Was Filed 11/7/2024 the County Auditor Mailed 11/2/2024 or Poplication to Township 11/2/2024 erk or City Auditor	(must be writhin live business days of filling date)	
	Ap	ıme of Applic	ounty Auditor's File No. ste Application Was Filec ith The County Auditor Mail te County Auditor Mail pplication to Township erk or City Auditor		

Application For Abatement Or Refund Of Taxes North Dakota Century Code § 57-23-04

File with the County Auditor on or before November 1 of the year following the year in which the tax becomes delinquent

State of North Dakota	Assessment District	City of Fargo		2.1 P. S. V. JAN TO	enancia di un anche e E fi
County of Cass	Property I.D. No.	01-2240-02645-00	00	NewVI	2024 PHD2:51
Name Park Ridge Apartments, LLP		Telephone No. (763	3) 445-4184		
Address 150 South Fifth Street Minneapolis, MN 554	102	1			
Legal description of the property involved in this application: ORIGINAL TOWNSITE LOTS 4-6 BLK 23 & PT I VAC ALLEY ADJ TO LOTS 4-6 *01-19-93 SPLIT			OT 3 AND	N 10'	
Total true and full value of the property described above for the year $\frac{2023}{}$ is:		Total true and full valuabove for the year	ue of the proper 2023 shoul	ty described d be:	
Land \$_85.000		Land	\$ 85,000		
Improvements \$ 4,328,000		Improvements	\$_3,499,000		
Total \$\(\frac{4,413,000}{(1)}\)		Total	\$ 3,548,000		
The difference of \$ 829,000.00 true and full value bet	tween (1) and (2) abov	e is due to the following	.,		
1. Agricultural property true and full value exceeds its agricultural property and full value exceeds its agricultural property and full value exceeds are commercial property true and full value exceeds and are commercial property in true and full value exceeds are commercial property and full value exceeds are commercially and full value exceeds a commercial property description, or extended as a commercial property in the property is exempt from taxation. Attach a commercial property improvement was destroyed or damaged by fire, flow and a commercial property improvement was destroyed or damaged by fire, flow and are commercially property qualifies for Homestead Credit (N.D.C.C. § 57-02-0 the application. 10. Other (explain)	eeds the market value ending the tax copy of Application for od, tornado, or other na	Property Tax Exemption. tural disaster (see N.D.C	C.C. § 57-23-04(1		
yes/no	Other (exp Estimated v.ves/no If yes, how lon of appraisal: Market value estimate: \$ in this application is \$	lain)g?			
Applicant asks that ### Property By filing this application, I consent to an inspection of the above-descriappraisal of the property. I understand the official will give me reasonal ideclare under the penalties of N.D.C.C. § 12.1-11-02, which provide matter, that this application is, to the best of my knowledge and belief,	able notification of the i	norized assessment offici nspection. See N.D.C.C neanor for making a fals	al for the purpos	a governmental	1
Signature of Preparer (if other than applicant) Date	Signature of App	olicant	and the	11/5/24 Date	

Recommendation of the Governing Body of the City or Township

Recommendation of the govern	ning board of				
On	, the gov	verning board of this municipali	ty, after examination of this	application and the facts, passed	
a resolution recommending to	the Board of County Comr	nissioners that the application b	e		
(
o 					
Dated this	_day of				
Dated this	_ day 01	Ci	ity Auditor or Township Cle	rk	
	Action b	y the Board of County Con	nmissioners		
Application wasApprov	by action	on of	County Board of	of Commissioners.	
Daned was as assessing	i	SN-4 Date Control	O- 1- 0 57 22 04	and the state of t	
				rove this application. The taxable ed accordingly. The taxes, if paid,	
				in full settlement of taxes for the	
tax year				7 -	
We reject this applicati	on in whole or in part fo	r the following reason(s). Wr	itten explanation of the ra	tionale for the decision must be	
attached.					
\$ ====					
-					
Datad					
Dated	•				
County Auditor				Chairperson	
To de dividi To To		Certification of County Aud			
		nock the action stated above and t ment of taxes on the property d		the office of the County Treasurer	
Voor	Taxable Value	Tour	Date Paid	Payment Made Under Written Protest?	
Year	Taxable value	Tax	(if paid)	ves/no	
) yesino	
I further certify that the taxable	e valuation and the taxes or	dered abated or refunded by the	Board of County Commis	sioner are as follows:	
Year	Reduction in	Taxable Valuation	Reduc	ction in Taxes	
			Reduction in Taxes		
			J		
		A a	County Auditor	Date	
		7	ovanily readily.	Dato	
		*\$			
	1	no		ହ	
		3	7 7	ling dab	
	nent	<u>a</u>	20 20	nys of fl	
	atem	2 8	1 4 4	slacss d	
	Aba	Kidage A	2 2 2	five bu:	
	For and C	(.\(\inf \)		(must be within five business days of filing date)	
	ion	uk.	o. – oor oor	(Must be	
	Application For Abatement Or Refund Of Taxes	Name of Applicant Park Kidage Apartmends		, -	
	lqqv O	licant	itor's tion V unity / unity / Audit		
	4	ofApp	y Aud pplies The Cc ounty ation 1		
		Vате	County Auditor's File 1 Date Application Was 1 With The County Auditor N Application to Townsh Clerk or City Auditor		